



City of Dublin

**LAND USE & LONG  
RANGE PLANNING**

November 19, 2014

# **ARB Board Order for Demolition**

## **14-105ARB – BSC Historic Residential District**

### **94-100 North High Street**

This is a request for a demolition of an existing 37,500-square-foot, four-story building and a 9,400-square-foot, single-story building on the east side of North High Street, approximately 280 feet north of the intersection of North Street. This proposal is to be reviewed under the provision of Code Section 153.176 and the *Historic Dublin Design Guidelines*.

#### **Date of Application Acceptance**

Monday, November 3, 2014

#### **Date of Architectural Review Board Determination**

Wednesday, November 19, 2014

#### **Case Manager**

Jennifer M. Rauch, AICP, Senior Planner | (614) 410-4690 | [jrauch@dublin.oh.us](mailto:jrauch@dublin.oh.us)

## **PART I: Application Overview**

<i>Zoning District</i>	BSC Historic Transition District
<i>Use</i>	Two Office buildings
<i>Building Type</i>	N/A
<i>Review Type</i>	Demolition
<i>Development Proposal</i>	Future redevelopment of mixed-use and residential.
<i>Property Address</i>	94-100 North High Street
<i>Applicant</i>	Nelson Yoder, Crawford Hoying; and Gerry Bird, OHM Advisors
<i>Case Manager</i>	Jennifer M. Rauch, AICP, Senior Planner   (614) 410-4690   jrauch@dublin.oh.us

## **Part II: Application Review Procedure: Board Order for Demolition**

No building permit or Certificate of Zoning Plan Approval may be issued by the Chief Building Official or Director and/or their designees for any proposal which is subject to review by the Architectural Review Board unless a Board Order has been issued in accordance with the requirements of Chapter 153: Zoning Regulations. Board Orders are required for requests for demolition of a structure in accordance with the requirements of Section §153.176.

### ***§153.176 – Demolition***

*In cases where an applicant applies for a Board Order to demolish a structure within the Architectural Review District, the application may be approved when the applicant is able to demonstrate economic hardship or unusual and compelling circumstances, or at least two of the following conditions prevail:*

- (1) The structure contains no features of architectural and historic significance to the character of the area in which it is located.*
- (2) There is no reasonable economic use for the structure as it exists or as it might be restored, and that there exists no feasible and prudent alternative to demolition.*
- (3) Deterioration has progressed to the point where it is not economically feasible to restore the structure and such neglect has not been willful.*
- (4) The location of the structure impedes the orderly development, substantially interferes with the Purposes of the District, or detracts from the historical character of its immediate vicinity; or, the proposed construction to replace the demolition significantly improves the overall quality of the Architectural Review District without diminishing the historic value of the vicinity or the District.*

### **PART III: Description of the Property**

The subject property contains two existing office buildings located at 94 and 100 North High Street. The 94 N. High Street building is a four-story, 37,500-square-foot structure constructed in 1985 and the 100 N. High Street building is a one-story, 9,400-square-foot structure constructed in 1987. Neither building is on the Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) or the National Register of Historic Places. The site contains a significant change in topography  $\pm 40$  from west to east with the buildings located at the lower elevation. Parking is located between the two buildings and the private drive that provides access to the site is located along the eastern property line and intersects with North Street at the southeast corner of the site. There is a significant exposed rock face along the southwestern cliff of the site.

### **PART IV: Analysis of Applicable Review Standards**

The Review Standards for Demolition of Section §153.176 provide two options for an applicant to request a Board Order for Demolition from the ARB. An applicant may either demonstrate an economic hardship or unusual and compelling circumstances to support the demolition, OR the applicant may demonstrate compliance with at least two of four Conditions for Demolition in that section.

The information provided by the applicant as part of the application materials describes that the Conditions for Demolition portion of the criteria and how they have been met. The following is an analysis based on those Review Standards and the information provided by the applicant.

#### ***At least two of the following Conditions for Demolition prevail:***

##### ***(1) The structure contains no features of architectural and historic significance to the character of the area in which it is located.***

**Condition met with condition.** The assessment of the two existing buildings indicates they were constructed in 1985 and 1987, and are not part of the Historic Dublin core. The buildings do not provide unique architectural features or historic significance that detract from the character of the District, if removed. The buildings are not identified as historic structures by the standards of the Secretary of the Department of the Interior, and are neither on the OHI or the National Register. The site does contain an existing exposed, vertical rock face at the southwestern portion of the site. This significant natural feature provides a unique site element to be retained and incorporated as part of the proposed redevelopment and shall be protected as part of the demolition and construction.

##### ***(2) There is no reasonable economic use for the structure as it exists or as it might be restored, and that there exists no feasible and prudent alternative to demolition.***

**Condition Not Met.** The owner continues to lease space and use the structures.

##### ***(3) Deterioration has progressed to the point where it is not economically feasible to restore the structure and such neglect has not been willful.***

**Condition Not Met.** Based on a cursory analysis, the exterior of the structures show the degree of deterioration has not progressed beyond normal aging of the buildings. The structure remain economically feasible to maintain and operate, which has been reinforced by the owner's ability to continue to retain building tenants.

***(4) The location of the structure impedes the orderly development, substantially interferes with the Purposes of the District, or detracts from the historical character of its immediate vicinity;***

***OR, the proposed construction to replace the demolition significantly improves the overall quality of the Architectural Review District without diminishing the historic value of the vicinity or the District.***

**Condition Met.** With respect to the first component, the structures are located on a private drive facing the Scioto River, and at the edge of the Architectural Review District, they do not necessarily interfere with the orderly development of the area unless viewed with respect to potential redevelopment.

The Purposes of the District are outlined in several adopted plans, including the Bridge Street Vision Report and the Community Plan, and are described under the second component of this standard. The applicant has provided conceptual drawings of the proposed construction to replace the demolition. The proposed development with internal parking garages will contain a mix of retail, restaurant, office, and residential units.

Historic Dublin has been the focus of considerable attention in past studies and adopted plans, and has consistently depicted the redevelopment of this area to achieve several objectives identified in these plans. The foremost among these are the *Community Plan*, and the *Bridge Street Vision Report*.

**Community Plan:** The Future Land Use Map in the Community Plan designates this area, and the core of the Historic District as a Mixed Use Village Center. This is generally described as an integrated mix of land uses within a pedestrian oriented environment. The proposed mix of uses is generally consistent with the Future Land Use designation of Mixed Use Village Center as identified in the Community Plan.

For Historic Dublin, the Community Plan identifies a goal "To enhance and revitalize Historic Dublin as an activity center within the city that is vibrant, pedestrian-oriented and user friendly with an integrated mix of uses that supports economic, civic, recreational and housing opportunities for all segments of Dublin's population."

*Historic Dublin Area Plan:* The Area Plan for this portion of the Historic District includes the provisions for adaptive reuse or redevelopment for high-end residential overlooking ravine and river. A future pedestrian bridge over the Scioto River is also recommended in this area of the Plan, along with public access to a riverfront boardwalk and trail system.

***Bridge Street Corridor Study Vision Report:*** This proposal is addressed as part of the *Bridge Street Corridor Vision Report* which defines the optimal role for the corridor for the future by describing the corridor in a Vision Statement supported by five Vision Principles.

*Vision Principles:*

The Vision Principles are action-oriented concepts that lead to the fulfillment of the Vision. The Principles provide a framework for decision-making, communicate the intent of the Vision Plan recommendations, and provide a context for addressing critical issues or future decisions not

anticipated at this time. Elements of these Principles are met through the proposed redevelopment. The Principles are:

1. Enhance economic vitality: Create vibrant and walkable mixed-use districts that build on the community's quality and character to make a highly competitive place to live, work, and invest.
2. Integrate the new center in the community life: Connect the Bridge Street Corridor to the surrounding community through enhanced bike, pedestrian, auto and transit connections, lively public spaces and a mix of retail and other uses that invite the larger community, and with civic, educational, and other uses to engage the full spectrum of community life.
3. Embrace Dublin's natural setting and celebrate a commitment to environmental sustainability: Celebrate the Scioto River, North/South Indian Run, and other natural features as symbols of Dublin's commitment to environmental preservation and sustainability.
4. Expand the range of choices available to Dublin and the region. Offer housing, jobs, shopping, recreation, transportation and other choices increasingly supported by changing demographics and lifestyles to complement and strengthen Dublin's existing community fabric.
5. Create places that embody Dublin's commitment to community: Design a 21st-century center for community inspired by Historic Dublin and marked by walkability, variety, and vitality.

#### *Historic Dublin District Vision*

The site is located within the Historic Dublin District of the *Bridge Street Corridor Vision Report*. Many of the specific design recommendations in the Historic Dublin District Vision Framework for this area build on those identified in the Historic Dublin Area Plan within the *Community Plan* and are incorporated into the proposed redevelopment of this site.

1. Near-term pedestrian and parking improvements as a key element of successful new development to enhance existing conditions.
2. Sensitive mixed-use redevelopment of infill sites with an emphasis on housing as a complement to existing uses.
3. Long-term potential to redevelop the school site as a mixed-use development to complement Historic Dublin's existing core. (Not applicable)

The Historic District Vision also recommends that natural areas and neighborhoods surrounding the district be treated sensitively in all cases and that new development must avoid creating negative impacts in these areas. This statement was added by the City to recognize the existing South Riverview neighborhood.

The proposed redevelopment would contribute greatly to the advancement of all of the Community Plan, and the Bridge Street Vision Principles. The creation of a mixed-use development located in the Bridge Street District would enhance the economic vitality of Dublin, expand the range of choices and quality of life for residents, and present opportunities to better engage the Scioto River. This project

will ultimately improve the overall quality of the Architectural Review District without diminishing the historic value of the vicinity or the District.

## **PART V: RECOMMENDATION**

Approval of the request for Board Order for Demolition is recommended, having effectively demonstrated two of the four standards for Demolition with the following conditions:

- 1) The existing exposed, vertical rock face at the southwestern portion of the site will be retained and incorporated as part of the proposed redevelopment and shall be protected as part of the demolition and construction, subject to approval by staff.
- 2) The demolition will not occur until a demolition and construction plan outlining schedule, construction and demolition access, and additional relevant details have been reviewed and approved by staff.